

## A Personal Response to Gail Hornstein's *To Redeem One Person Is to Redeem the World: The Life of Frieda Fromm-Reichmann*

ANN-LOUISE S. SILVER

This article summarizes events surrounding the closing of Chestnut Lodge, as a backdrop to the author's reactions on reading Frieda Fromm-Reichmann's biography. This anecdotal piece forms a complementary essay with the 2000 Frieda Fromm-Reichmann Lecture, "The Current Relevance of Fromm-Reichmann's Works." It illustrates aspects of treatment of schizophrenia and of the individuals involved in such work.

Chestnut Lodge officially closed on April 27, 2001; Frieda Fromm-Reichmann died exactly 44 years earlier, on April 27, 1957. Noting this mystical symmetry is no solace as I mourn the loss of my professional home of 25 years, whose core, Main Building, was built in 1889, the year of Fromm-Reichmann's birth. We are fortunate, however, that we now have a strong biography of Fromm-Reichmann to inspire and guide the next generation. My personal loss is minor compared to the losses Fromm-Reichmann faced fleeing Nazi

Germany in 1933, or the losses former Lodge and Community Psychiatric Clinics (CPC) patients and their families are now enduring.

As I interact with Gail Hornstein's formidable and vivid text, I have tried to keep "sour grapes" from overpowering my admiration for this biography: The Lodge is gone; I had often imagined doing a biography of Fromm-Reichmann. I learned a great deal from both the text and the book's very extensive bibliography and endnotes that have pointed me to many important sources. I hope Gail's book will inspire the current generation of mental health professionals and other readers. I hope they will study Fromm-Reichmann's *Principles of Intensive Psychotherapy* (1950), her selected papers, edited by Dexter Bullard, Sr. (1959), and Joanne Greenberg's *I Never Promised You a Rose Garden* (1964). I hope they will consider joining ISPS (The International Society for the Psychological treatments of the Schizophrenias and other psychoses) and will contact me for details. Most importantly, I hope they will work psychotherapeutically with patients diagnosed with schizophrenia. ISPS will help locate local supervisors or establish study groups.<sup>1</sup>

---

*Ann-Louise S. Silver, MD*, is an Adjunct Professor of Psychiatry at the Uniformed Services University of the Health Sciences, and teaches at the Military Residency Training Program, the Washington Psychoanalytic Institute, and the Washington School of Psychiatry. She heads the newly formed Columbia Academy of Psychodynamics, affiliated with the Washington School of Psychiatry. She is in private practice in psychoanalysis and psychiatry.

She is the president of the United States Chapter of the International Society for the Psychological treatments of the Schizophrenias and other psychoses, ISPS-US in Columbia and Rockville, MD, and is a past president of the American Academy of Psychoanalysis and Dynamic Psychiatry.

Address correspondence to Dr. Silver at 4966 Reedy Brook Lane, Columbia, MD 21044-1514. E-mail: [asilver@psychoanalysis.net](mailto:asilver@psychoanalysis.net).

---

1. Gail mentions Joanne Greenberg's presentation to the Columbia (Maryland) Study Group

I recommend the festschrift I edited, *Psychoanalysis and Psychosis*.<sup>2</sup> Almost all of its twenty-eight contributors had worked closely with Fromm-Reichmann. They all contributed personal sections about Frieda along with new scientific papers. The book celebrated the 50th anniversary of Frieda's arrival at the Lodge (Silver 1989). Also, in the year 2000 I gave the Frieda Fromm-Reichmann Lecture at the Washington School of Psychiatry, "The Current Relevance of the Works of Frieda Fromm-Reichmann"<sup>3</sup> (Silver 2000). Here, I will limit my remarks to a conversation with Gail, as I am "Ann" in her book, and we both discuss "Frieda."

The Lodge was a world-cherished bea-

---

on Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy, a group which has met monthly at my home since 1979. In June of 1986, Joanne was our featured speaker at an event held at the local community college. Her talk, "Metaphor and the Treatment of Schizophrenia" was videotaped. We rent copies, which Joanne insists not be copied by renters, for \$30; we share the proceeds with Joanne. If you are interested, write to me, with a check made out to the Columbia Academy of Psychodynamics.

2. I do regret that Gail did not reference Douglas Noble and Donald Burnham's 1989 "History of the Washington Psychoanalytic Institute and Society" as forming Chapter 26 in this book. She mentions only their 1969 private printing, which would be extremely hard for scholars to locate (Hornstein, p. 407). Also, this material is posted on the webpage of the Washington Psychoanalytic Society: <http://www.washpsa.org/society/history.htm>. An edited transcript of the autobiographical tape Fromm-Reichmann made is also included, along with a fascinating interview Joanne Greenberg held with Laurice McAfee (1989). Wendy Leeds-Hurwitz's chapter amplifies and gives background to Fromm-Reichmann's year at Stanford and her work with Don Jackson, Ray L. Birdwhistell, and Henry Brosin on the microanalysis of an interview. Pollyanne Curry Feuer and I (1989) have a chapter reviewing all of Fromm-Reichmann's contributions at the Lodge Wednesday Conferences. We quote Frieda often, something that, in my opinion, Gail did not do enough.

3. Patrick McGorry wrote recently to correct an error in that paper. His group is studying patients predominantly in their 20s, who demonstrate psychotic difficulties but have not become floridly and terrifiedly psychotic (McGorry, Yung, and Phillips, in press).

con for those who dedicated their careers to interpersonal insight-enhancing treatments of schizophrenia and other severe mental illnesses and for those in other areas of psychodynamic work, mainly thanks to Frieda. The Lodge was a place to send a decompensated patient, which would see things through. The Lodge's yearly symposia were quasi-religious retreats for local mental health professionals and for a few out-of-towners. Searles commented on a Lodge panel Frieda coordinated at a meeting of the American Psychoanalytic Association, "Intuitive Processes in the Psychotherapy of Schizophrenics." "As we were talking and presenting our papers, I was struck by how much we all sounded to be martyrs, these heroic martyrs . . ." (Langs and Searles, 1980, p. 80). This applied as well to very many Lodge Symposium presentations.

As if a great listing lighthouse finally crashed into the advancing tide, the event of Lodge closure seemed to "prove" the contentions of many (Dolnick 1998, Lehman and Steinwachs 1998) that psychoanalytic approaches should not be applied even in combination with psychotropic medications. The mental health professions have lost a model of excellence for the humane and deeply respectful care and treatment of patients struggling with psychotic disorders. Alfred H. Stanton was on the Lodge medical staff from 1941 to 1951 and coauthored with Morrie Schwartz (Ablon 1997) *The Mental Hospital* (Stanton and Schwartz, 1954). In his talk at the 1982 Lodge Symposium in memory of Dexter Means Bullard, Sr., "Some Implications of the Complexity of Ego Function and of Self-Representation for Psychotherapy with Psychotic Patients," Stanton described the Lodge as "lit by a blue flame of intellectual excitement which has been rare elsewhere."

We Lodge staff members have lost our buildings' safe strong containing walls, our inspiring grand trees, and our quiet bucolic niches where we and our patients could talk, knowing that around the clock there would be a dedicated staff strengthening our efforts, a place where we could say to our patients, "We have time." The most detailed accounts

of the Lodge's and CPC's dwindling were reported in the *Rockville Gazette*. Interested readers should consult their webpage, [www.gazette.net](http://www.gazette.net), and refer to their archives, searching under CPC. *Rockville Gazette* staff reporter Manju Subramanya won first place in the Suburban Newspapers of America 2000 Editorial Contest (*Gazette* staff, Feb. 7, 2001) for in-depth coverage of the unraveling of CPC.

Over the years, while Gail Hornstein developed her biography of Frieda, I imagined the book helping to rescue the increasingly troubled Lodge. An obituary may be premature. Gail's book may still help us. Kalyna Bullard, Dexter Bullard, Jr.'s, daughter-in-law, who served for a few years as the Lodge's lawyer, while not able to buy back the hospital, has secured the name Chestnut Lodge and has established it officially as a nonprofit institution. There is a donor ready to provide a sizable low-interest loan. The medical staff has purchased the Lodge library from the new owners of the site, The Waldorf School. Six of us worked for a day packing the books into 180 cartons, with an estimated weight of over four tons. We may host another symposium on the theme "Chestnut Lodge: Finis or Phoenix?"

Thus, complicated tensions color my response to *To Redeem One Person Is to Redeem the World*. Dexter Bullard, Jr., (Rusty) died on August 15, 1995. He had resisted publicizing his hospital, and his efforts to modernize the Lodge diminished the centrality of dyadic therapy. Then, in the midst of Rusty's grueling treatments for lung cancer, the extended Bullard family voted to sell the hospital rather than support Rusty's choice of successor as medical director, Wayne Fenton. Wayne had overseen streamlining of Lodge programs so that we ran at a profit during very challenging times. Our efforts at an employee's bid to purchase the Lodge ourselves failed in the 2 weeks preceding the bid deadline.

I had expected a bigger book—not that Gail's is small—just as those seeing Frieda for the first time were shocked to see she was only 4'10" tall. Helen Swick Perry's (1982) biography of Harry Stack Sullivan, runner-up for the 1982 Pulitzer Prize in biography,

developed Sullivan's ideas and set them in historic context by including biographical chapters on the institutions and the lives and works of various people most influential to Sullivan. Gail's four pages on Georg Groddeck (Hornstein 2000, pp. 34–37) form a gem-like brilliant and accurate summary of his work and personal style, but I wanted more. And I wanted mini-biographies on Karl Landauer and the other founders with Frieda of the Southwest German Psychoanalytic Institute. I wanted biographic sketches of Kurt Goldstein, Edith Weigert, Hilde Bruch, Sándor Ferenczi, and Dexter Bullard, for starters. Frieda was a leader at the Lodge, the Washington Psychoanalytic Society and Institute, the Washington School of Psychiatry, and the William A. White Institute in New York City. What do their archives reveal about Frieda's input into the various policy decisions they struggled with, for example, the historic decision to disenfranchise the White Institute, the break-up of the Washington-Baltimore Psychoanalytic Society, or the founding of the American Academy of Psychoanalysis?

Meanwhile, Gail says that Frieda wrote the same paper again and again. While certain vignettes kept reappearing, she wrote on a wide range of disorders, on various aspects of the symptoms of schizophrenia, and on the gradually evolving approaches to their treatment. I had expected a text that would be more specific in its use of the clinical archives of the Lodge, with greater detail on her work with her patients, charts of eleven of whom were accessible to Gail. Frieda spent much of her time analyzing institute candidates and supervising trainees in Washington and New York City. (Rusty Bullard told me that people generally were not aware that Frieda had half-, not full-time, Lodge responsibilities.) How many supervisees and analysands could Gail identify? Did any have annotated process notes and diary entries they may have kept? Might these papers have been in their own archives? How did Frieda apportion her time on a daily basis? What was her travel schedule like? (Perhaps this latter information was frustratingly locked away in Gunst's attic.) If I had

been directing the show, it could never have reached completion, with my escalating list of related projects. Donald Burnham's letter to Gail serves as another example of this phenomenon.<sup>4</sup>

When I received a letter from Joanne Greenberg written on May 8, 2000, that she had read the galley proofs and provided enthusiastic statements of endorsement, I was both

relieved and jealous. "WAIT until you read Gail Hornstein's book! It is just about everything we all wanted to say about what happened and what has been happening in psychiatry recently—it seems to me she got it all right." When I received my copy of Gail's book in February of 2001, the then-owners of Chestnut Lodge, CPC Health, had filed for Chapter 11 bankruptcy 4 months earlier, on

---

4. Donald Burnham granted permission to include the letter he sent to Gail on April 20, 2001.

Dear Gail,

I have read [your book] with great profit and admire enormously the prodigious work which it must have required to gather the vast array of meticulously detailed information from so many sources and then to weave it together so skillfully. A remarkable accomplishment of which you have abundant reason to be proud. Congratulations!

As you might expect, reading the book stirred all manner of memories and revived old conflicts and dilemmas, particularly as I read and re-read the "Luxury of Guilt" chapter where you described staff reactions to, and defenses against, the realization of the limits of the efficacy of psychotherapy and the undeniable truth that there was only one Frieda. I confess that I felt some impulses to mount something by way of a defense or at least to interject that it would be overdoing it to regard the staff's reactions as nothing but defense and a retreat from Frieda's credo. For instance, it seems an overstatement to that "Stanton's whole research project was an example" of this defense maneuver or to say that Frieda had been spared the pain of watching the place "rip itself to shreds."

I think that the interest in the social structure and interaction of the mental hospital was an effort to supplement, not to supplant, Frieda's approach. It also was in tune with a general wave of interest at that time in the idea of milieu therapy and therapeutic communities. This did of course also shade into the view of hospitals as antitherapeutic. In some ways it is ironic that Stanton and Schwartz's study may have stimulated such work as Bill Caudill's study of a ward at Yale (Caudill and Stainbrook [1954]), Goffman's (1961) critique, and Levinson's studies of roles and patienthood (Greenblatt, Levinson, and Williams, 1952)—numerous others as well. The article "Milieu Therapy" by Dave Rioch and Al Stanton in the 1953 *Psychiatry* is a nice statement of some of the thinking of the time.

Not all of what you referred to as "busywork" was defensive. For example, the Clinical Evaluation Committee was charged with making difficult and often painful decisions as to when the hospital had exhausted its efforts to be helpful to particular patients and to recommend their transfer. This and other committees of the time also were intended to afford staff and patients more say in decisions about the running of the hospital. In line with the therapeutic community credo there was an earnest effort to achieve a democratic small society.

I liked the excellent use you made of ex-patient responses to Clarence Schulz's follow-up inquiry and wish that you might also have included mention of his and Rose Kilgalen's case study book with its details of several treatment successes (Schulz & Kilgalen, 1969).

My hunch is that some of these things may have had to go by the board in the process of rewriting your book to put it more in the form of a biography rather than a study of the Lodge and of the place of private hospitals in the history of American psychiatry.

I wish also that space might have permitted a specific section on Frieda's impact as a teacher, bringing together mention of the remarkable careers of her students, including Bob Felix (NIMH), Larry Kolb, Ruth and Ted Lidz, Bob and Mabel Cohen, Josie Hilgard, Hilde Bruch, Alfred Stanton, Bob Gibson, Clarence Schulz, Don Jackson, Don Bloch, Helm Stierlin, and Otto Will. When you contemplate their influence as teachers and researchers it generates even greater appreciation of Frieda.

I realize of course that your primary focus was on Frieda as therapist, not so much on other dimensions of her career, and that there is only so much that one can do in the space of one book. I certainly hope that my remarks won't in any way diminish your awareness of my appreciation of the magnitude of what you have achieved.

My best, Don

October 11, 2000. A small group of Lodge staff had been exploring the possibility of establishing a new entity we called Rosegarden Lodge, and had found a property dating from the 1700s that could house ten or so patients, but required formidable repairs and improvements. This property was recently purchased by others.

On Sunday, December 3, 2000, I moved out of my Chestnut Lodge office to an office suite the group had rented, conveniently located next door to the Rockville Metro Station. I saw this as a logical hub of Rosegarden's step-down program, patients living in the neighboring apartment buildings, as many Lodge patients still do. My husband and I moved the furniture ourselves, denying our age. My back and my right knee throbbed. Having completed the move, we sat with one of the office mates, who informed us that he and one of the others had no interest in proceeding with the Rosegarden plan. It had been fun looking at the properties, but they were not interested in such an involvement at this point in their careers. My team instantly shrank to three.

After our conversation, I could not stand. I had torn a muscle or injured a ligament. This pain plagued me for a sleep-deprived month. The following morning, I read, "Frieda was especially fond of the song Mendelssohn's publisher had sentimentally entitled 'Lost Happiness.' Simple in texture, its wistful melody chopped into shorter and shorter units, giving a foreclosing feeling, the piece seems to climb toward something it never reaches. Wolf Weigert, son of Frieda's friend Edith,<sup>5</sup> remembers her playing it so often [on the piano], he thought of it as 'Frieda's

5. Edith Weigert (1894–1981) was a Training and Supervising Analyst at the Washington-Baltimore Psychoanalytic Society (and its President from 1944–1946) and then the Washington Psychoanalytic Society and Institute. She was the chair of the faculty of the Washington School of Psychiatry. Her book, *The Courage to Love* (1970), is a psychoanalytic classic. She wrote the introduction (1959) to the posthumously collected volume of Frieda's selected papers.

song." (Hornstein 2000, p. 116) This and Gail's own melodious writing became comforting background melodies during my wrenching relocation. Gail, an accomplished teacher, can hold the classes' attention—how much detail to include per lecture, how to enliven it, how to motivate her students, and how to develop their own scholarly fortitude. We become her students as we read.

I took Gail's book along on a ski vacation. Against my better judgment, I decided that even with continuing muscle spasm, I would try to ski. On my first run, I felt something give way, and the pain resolved in seconds. Skiing cured my injury (probably muscle trapped in torn fascia). Perhaps there *would* be life after the Lodge. I read Gail's book and began writing a response. However, later, as I was packing up my briefcase for work, I dropped my laptop computer down some stairs. The hard disk crashed; I lost my draft of this paper. My loyal "assistant" had suffered a stroke. I am including these injuries as physical evidence of my internal upheaval. Everyone working at the Lodge, whether as a patient or a staff member, has suffered enormously and chronically during the slow decline and closure of the Lodge, many of us experiencing escalating "life change units," probably in the danger zone if scored on the Miller–Rahe Recent Life Change Questionnaire.

Gail noted, "Various of Frieda's later admirers made pilgrimages to the cemetery [to Frieda's grave]; one tried to plant a rose garden by her headstone" (Hornstein 2000, p. 340). I recalled our pilgrimage on October 13, 1989, when she and Mabel Peterson, the then-retired Chestnut Lodge executive secretary, and I drove together to the Mt. Lebanon Cemetery in Hyattsville, Maryland, to pay tribute to Frieda on the approximate 100th anniversary of her birth, October 23, 1889. We had invited others on the Lodge staff to accompany us on that beautiful Indian summer day, but none came. Gail recited the *kaddish*, the traditional Jewish prayer for the dead. I read from *Principles of Intensive Psychotherapy*, and Mabel read from *I Never Promised You a Rose Garden*. There was a spray-painted stencil in the upper left-hand corner of the

gravestone, with the letters OA within a circle about 3 inches in diameter. We attempted to scrub this off with sand. We then planted a rose bush, a "Matador," red and yellow, honoring this clinical fighter. I wanted to get water for the rose bush. The grave is on a hillside within sight of a valley, and we could hear a gurgling stream. I trudged through brambles, tearing my stockings to shreds, but could not find the stream, which was probably washing through an underground culvert. Disappointed, I trudged back, but as I was leaving the wooded section, there was a builder's bucket, brimming with fresh rainwater. Of course, I felt this was a little miracle, and still have the bucket in my garage, a relic, perhaps a linking object of pathological mourning (Volkan 1981). Gail later told me that the rose bush had been torn out by those maintaining the cemetery, which forbids private plantings.

Gail talks about the items Frieda had owned, now in admirers' homes as if they are relics of St. Catherine (Hornstein 2001, p. B7). My linking object for Gail's collection was the white dove that flew into my backyard the morning after the 1985 Chestnut Lodge Symposium I had organized, which celebrated the 50th anniversary of Fromm-Reichmann's arrival there.<sup>6</sup> That dove waited for me on a low tree branch while I rushed to the garage

for a fishnet. I easily caught her and saw that she had an ulcer under her right wing. I bathed the lesion in bactericidal soap, dried it with my hair dryer and set her up in residence in my small greenhouse. Whenever I entered the greenhouse, she alighted on my shoulder and stroked my cheek. She laid sterile eggs, nesting in a hanging basket. My mystical side saw her as a gift from Frieda, a token of her appreciation. My objective side considered her a last survivor of the flock of white doves released from the Annapolis stadium at the start of a soccer tournament.

Gail gratefully acknowledged Sylvia Hoff Collins's, my, and Ursula Engel's contributions, adding, "although I don't agree with certain of their key ideas, my thinking has been powerfully shaped by the trail they blazed" (Hornstein 2000, p. xxix.). When I phoned Gail, congratulating her on the birth of her powerful and evocative book, I asked her, "What are our areas of disagreement?" She responded, "Excellent question. I guess, that you're a clinician and I'm an academician." But how does this become disagreement? Rather than disagreement, I would call it a disjuncture between the interviewing styles and agendas of academic historians and mental health clinicians. The former, when interviewing, ask questions hoping for a disclosing and specific response with documentation when possible, which might be included in a work communicating with unknown readers present and future, the more the better. The latter, when interviewing, ask general questions, hoping for a discursive response leading to other areas, wherever the unconscious leads. The former will follow up with further focused questions; the latter may respond with an interpretation, which might be supported with disclosure of the interviewer's own associations. The clinician promises confidentiality. Gail was struck by the guardedness of some of her interviewees, and their readiness to take on a clinician-patient stance with her, offering interpretations of her dynamics. She wondered whether they were holding grudges against Frieda somehow. She said about these interviews, "During an especially intense week, I found myself watching the entire Gulf War

---

6. John Fort chaired the morning session; Dexter Bullard, Jr., welcomed the audience, almost 650 attendees, some seated in overflow rooms, watching the programs from television sets. I spoke on Fromm-Reichmann's contributions in staff conferences; Harold Searles spoke on borderline psychopathology as revealed by the patient's (1) pauses and (2) ungrammatical word order; and Ruth Lidz spoke on the use of anxiety and hostility in the treatment of schizophrenic patients. Robert A. Cohen chaired the afternoon program, reading Samuel V. Thompson's posthumous paper, "The Petite Giant," then Alberta Szalita delivered "Some Thoughts on Fromm-Reichmann's 'On Loneliness.'" Lawrence C. Kolb spoke on terror, the startle response, and dissociation. Then Laurice McAfee reported on her interviews with Joanne Greenberg. Otto A. Will concluded the day, speaking on "Incidental Thoughts on the Unending Road of Learning to be a Psychotherapist."

every night on TV to recuperate" (Hornstein 2001, p. B7).

Perhaps these analyst-interviewees were conveying something of what it was like for them in their relationships with Frieda. Did *Frieda* interpret in this uninvited way? Were they trying to get Gail to feel what it was like for them to be in Frieda's presence? Had Gail been a clinician, she would have welcomed that sense of tension and perplexity and pursued it. Frieda seems to have felt entitled to know the turmoils of those around her. Perhaps Frieda extracted information from them just as she had commandeered Virginia Gunst to serve as her secretary and then chauffeur, even driving her to Santa Fe for the summer while her husband and children were in Maryland. Frieda also would call the wives of junior Lodge staff to bring their children by the office between 10 and 11 when she had a free hour, so she could play with them.

Meanwhile, Gail sometimes overestimated the uniqueness of interviewees' disclosures to her. She gives as an example someone telling how beleaguered he had felt when Frieda, supervising him on a case, had said he felt burdened when she advised him to make every session with that patient a memorable experience. John Fort loved recounting this and other stories, and published them in his chapter in *Psychoanalysis and Psychosis* (Fort 1989, p. 250). Gail comments, "I sympathized with his struggle but couldn't imagine how he could think that he alone had these feelings, or that revealing them now—half a century later—could be so difficult" (Hornstein 2001, p. B8).

I do not think an academician can adequately appreciate the complex and chronic tensions endured by mental health clinicians. We navigate the treacherous political waters within psychoanalytic and other professional organizations (Kirsner, 2000; Quinn, 1987; Roazen, 2001), the tensions within the treatment hours, and the struggle with managed care firms and those entities working to standardize and limit treatment approaches. We are beleaguered, as was Frieda. Robert A. Cohen has told us about the time Frieda returned from a meeting of the American Psychoana-

lytic Association where, in response to a paper she had just delivered, one of the powerful members had stood to ask her, "What right do you have to call yourself a psychoanalyst?" Some of us rely on Fromm-Reichmann's outspoken fierce dedication not so much in deification but as a cherished role model.

The temporal context of Gail's interviews might also be relevant: The Lodge Mental Health Foundation suffered a last-minute failure in its employees' effort to purchase the hospital. CPC, which had been positioning itself for such a purchase well before Rusty's fatal illness was diagnosed, purchased the Lodge in August of 1996. As detailed in the *Rockville Gazette*, in a brief 4½ years CPC drove the hospital into \$11 million of debt. We on the Lodge staff experienced the CPC leadership from the start as resisting our efforts to team up with them and to orient them to the workings of a proud and successful institution. Even if Gail's interviewees were not actively involved in these struggles, they knew we were warily treading on dangerously thinning ice.

Furthermore, we in Washington had become apprehensive about Gail's book upon hearing her deliver the 1996 Frieda Fromm-Reichmann Lecture of the Washington School of Psychiatry, "The Illness is the Cure, not the Affliction." Gail had presented the material we find in her book on pages 309–313. She documented how over the years Fromm-Reichmann's account of taking a particular patient out of cold wet sheet pack drifted ever further from the account she had first recorded in the patient's progress notes. Was she thus giving us notice that her book might leave us feeling betrayed yet again? We were badly burned by the friendly and seemingly supportive Sandra Boodman, whose cover story on the Sunday *Washington Post Magazine* of October 8, 1989, seemed to portray the Lodge as antiquated and harmful. Ms. Boodman had spent 1½ hours interviewing a prestigious Lodge alumnus. After the interview concluded and the tape recorder was put away, he made an off-the-cuff remark about working under Dexter Bullard's tight-fisted leadership.

This was the only remark of his that Boodman quoted (Boodman, 1989, p. 24.).

Donald Burnham, editor of *Psychiatry* from 1962 to 1985, served as discussant of Gail's Fromm-Reichmann Lecture. Hornstein alludes to their pre-meeting correspondence (Hornstein 2000, pp. 343–344). In Burnham's (unpublished) formal discussion, he said, "Appropos of her [Frieda's] conflict about the authority role, in her accounts of 'the moment' with Mrs. E. she tended to downplay the fact that the whole incident began with her asking for the patient's signature on checks, including one to pay the Lodge bill, at Dr. Bullard's behest. One wonders what part Frieda's conflict about being assigned the role of bill-collector played in this entire episode."<sup>7</sup>

Meanwhile, Gail's treatment of Searles's work is harsh. I wonder whether he has become the container for Gail's hostilities toward Frieda. (Here, I illustrate that aspect of her interviews that she found maddening, these gratuitous interpretations we Lodge staff members all indulged in toward each other. The idea was that we were not insulting each other but were complimenting the other by challenging them, the assumption being that they could take it.) Gail describes Searles's public interviews as "exhibitionistic" (Hornstein 2000, p. 375), and the psychiatrist-audiences as "stunned." Searles held these interviews weekly at the Sheppard and Enoch Pratt Hospital for years, and went monthly to the Columbia University psychiat-

ric residency program, also for years. These programs paid him honoraria and travel expenses. They found his specific teaching and the resultant discussion vitally important to their programs. Had the audiences been simply stunned, would the programs have continued their sponsorship?

Searles held two such interviews during my residency at the Johns Hopkins Hospital's Henry Phipps Psychiatric Clinic. The residency group discussed specific aspects of these interviews for months. Even now, some 30 years later, when I meet up with my fellow residents at meetings of the American Psychiatric Association, they often reminisce, recalling specific events in those interviews, and they acknowledge how Searles still influences their work. Gail does not acknowledge Searles's profoundly positive influence, intensively provoking nearly two generations of psychiatrists to look beyond the confines of a professional pseudo-ideal of objectivity and prescription.

Gail quotes Searles as "following in Frieda's footsteps" (Hornstein 2000, p. 375). The full quotation is

But it was also my impression that [Frieda] did not trouble herself to be particularly diplomatic as to how she felt about some of the more conservative people she encountered at meetings of the American; so that I can believe that they were left smarting by her bluntness. So that then, as I came along on the scene, to some extent—although I don't like to think to any large degree, but to some extent—following in her footsteps, I think probably I inherited some of the animosity that these people had developed toward her. (Langs and Searles, p. 83)

7. Burnham continues, "Frieda's staunch belief in a constructive drive toward health, a drive as strong as hunger and thirst and present in even the sickest of patients, was, as Dr. Hornstein emphasizes, an important element in her therapeutic credo. I have a hunch that this belief in an inherent constructive drive with which she could form an alliance may have relieved some of her conflict about [being] singled out as the responsible authority. Dr. Hornstein correctly likens this to Groddeck's belief that the doctor was the servant of the "it." Very similar is Ferenczi's concept of "Orpha," a personified set of life-organizing instincts which are supra-individual, beyond one's personal control, and which function as a sort of guardian angel and guide the treatment process." [I myself recommend Nancy Smith's papers on Orpha, especially Smith 2001.—A.-L.S.]

Gail says, "[Searles's] dream was to be hired at the Lodge, but Bullard, concerned that Searles wasn't stable enough for the work, insisted he enter analysis first" (Hornstein 2000, p. 375). Was she referring just to Searles's introductory remarks as he began his 1965 American Academy of Psychoanalysis Frieda Fromm-Reichmann Award address? "Never have I been turned down with more coldness and lack of interest, in a job interview, than I was the first time I had an interview with Dexter Bullard. It may be because I had had no

personal analysis at that time, and people were, as I later found out, not accepted without having had at least some" (Langs and Searles, 1980, p. 38 f.n.). "Searles seemed to need his patients to remain ill . . ." (Hornstein 2000, p. 376). Searles, while he chose to work with the sickest of the Lodge patients, saw the full range of patients in his private practice, and did not need them to stay ill or satisfy some appetite in him for symptoms and difficulties. He wrote eloquently on a wide range of topics. His paper "Unconscious Processes in Relation to the Environmental Crisis" (Searles, 1979), when first presented at the 1970 Lodge Symposium, received the only standing ovation, to my knowledge, at this annual event.

Gail's searing indictment of Searles is both inaccurate and wrong. Hyperbole mars other aspects of the book, as when Gail says that Frieda's work "stands in contradiction to everything contemporary psychiatry believes in" (Hornstein 2000, p. xxvii) or describes (St.) Frieda "floating" into a room. Tanya Luhrmann's (2001) one criticism of this biography is that "the tone . . . is frustratingly hyperbolic" (p. 7). I wonder, is Gail paradoxically identifying with Frieda and her strongly held, sometimes incendiary, opinions, too often stated as fact, for example, Frieda's descriptions of "the schizophrenogenic mother"?

Gail presented a vignette from a recorded session of work with Mr. R. Frieda's technique seemed inadequate. While it troubled Gail, paradoxically I found it reassuring (Hornstein 2000, pp. 327-329).

There would be a long silence, and then suddenly he would stand up, say, "I'm leaving," and be out the door before Frieda could say a word. Sometimes he came back fifteen minutes later; often he didn't. His leaving made Frieda furious. We can hear her on the tapes banging things around in the office and telephoning secretaries and nurses, demanding that he be located and brought back to her. Once she told him "I came all the way over here to see you and you're not walking out." Two minutes later, when he did just that, we can hear her yelling, "God damn it!" (Hornstein 2000, p. 328)

A patient I have worked with now for over a decade had, early on, exasperated and

frightened me by repeatedly announcing her suicidal intent and then abruptly leaving mid-session. She had no Lodge connection; she lived alone. After yet another emotional assault and flight, I was so agitated I lost any "evenly-hovering neutrality" and yelled after her into the night air outside my suburban home office, "Get back *in* here, you goddam rude bitch!" She threw her keys at me and said, "I want you to *love* me!" I said, "I'm *trying*!" She kidded me in the next session that this interaction would appear in the definitive biography of me that she was preparing. This is messy work, with no room for saints or perfect sessions. What Gail called "a caricature of the therapeutic process" (Hornstein 2000, p. 327) may be the reverse. Published representations of the therapeutic process too often are condensed self-serving caricatures of the actual interplay. Gail is helping us to confront such aspects in Frieda's *Principles of Intensive Psychotherapy*.

Fromm-Reichmann was a female hero, who had yearned for children of her own. Perhaps some of us (myself and Gail included) have "adopted" her as a "substitute mother," and then we get into metaphoric "sibling rivalries." Whose Frieda is more real, Gail's or mine? Neither of us ever met her; each of us has heard her voice and her laughter on her autobiographical tape recording. Frieda was her parents' favorite. Who would be her favorite "daughter"? Perhaps we each wonder if she would bother much with either of us, or we with her. Gail, having spent well over 10 years with "Frieda," clearly knows her subject well.

An intriguing background in this richly woven book is spirituality and Judaism, a specific acceptance of the mystical, its relevance to the full range of the science of psychoanalysis. Here Fromm-Reichmann's interest in intuition and empathy continues that of her friend and colleague Sándor Ferenczi. He was very interested in the occult, and encouraged Freud's interests in the powers of psychics. There is an often-told joke about a Jew marooned for years as the only human on a tropical island. When he is finally discovered, his rescuers are amazed to see that he has built an entire bamboo town, or steti, with a school,

butcher shop, bakery, and so on, and two synagogues. "Why two?" they ask him. "They can't agree about anything. They argue all the time," the survivor explained.

In my synagogue (Dexter Bullard, Jr., and Tom McGlashan had told me I was the most conservative on the Lodge staff regarding the use of medications) there would be more direct quotations from the Torah and from Talmud, where the great rabbis' arguments would be debated by the congregants. The service would be twice as long as at Gail's. The congregants would leave services exhilarated by critiquing the nuances of the text and each others' interpretations, just as we on the Lodge staff were exhilarated by many of the Wednesday Conferences. There, we fervently critiqued the presenter's description of his or her work with a particular patient. If the presenter felt the work was going nowhere, we found evidence of change, and if the presenter had been self-congratulatory we had an intellectual feeding frenzy (Silver 1993). While we rarely referred to Fromm-Reichmann directly, seldom mentioning her *Principles of Intensive Psychotherapy*, I felt we were performing a ritual of scrutiny of transference and counter-transference, keeping a certain flame burning, a psychological everlasting light.

Now, we have been exiled from the temple, perhaps a consequence of not keeping kosher, but instead over-relying on prescribing medications, losing faith in the centrality of the interpersonal and *tikkun*. Gail (Hornstein 2000, p. xvi) quotes Joseph Dan (1986).

During the process of creation, God's divine emanations were gathered together and stored in sacred vessels. But the vessels, unable to contain the light pouring into them, shattered, fragmenting the divine sparks, which fell to earth. The world became chaotic; nothing was in its proper realm. The task of human history and the responsibility of every Jew is to rescue the divine sparks and restore order to the world. This is the work known as *tikkun*. When it is fully accomplished, redemption will come to everyone. *Tikkun* is a collective task; no one person can perform it on his own. . . . If a person fulfills her duty and strictly follows the ethical path, that spark is restored to its source

in the divine realm. To assist another is to do God's work. (94-103).

Gail concludes her book by elaborating, through a summary of a lecture by Alan Stone, a statement of despair she made at the start of her book, that Frieda's "work stands in contradiction to everything contemporary psychiatry believes in" (Hornstein 2000, p. xxvii). Burnham (1996), in his discussion of Gail's Fromm-Reichmann Lecture had said,

I share her [Gail's] regret that Frieda's example and teachings have not had greater and more lasting effects on the treatment of the mentally ill. However, I disagree with what seems to me to be too sweeping and too simplified an indictment of psychiatry. I must dispute the assertion that "psychiatry has done its best to convince us that there is no hope for serious mental disturbances" or that "despair has deformed psychiatry for over one hundred years." For one thing, psychiatry is not a monolith, and certainly does not speak with one voice. In fact, at times such as the present it may be more of a tower of Babel. Moreover, dispute about causes and appropriate treatment is *not* equivalent to blanket therapeutic nihilism. Yes, there are voices who contend that psychotherapy is useless, but there still are active therapists and researchers devoted to the psycho-social treatment of schizophrenia, embattled though they may be at this time in history.

Burnham concluded his discussion:

Study of [the] recovery process, including the view of mental illness as an attempt at problem solution, can be a most illuminating endeavor and is much to be encouraged, especially when the patient joins as a collaborator in the study. I believe this is part of what Dr. Hornstein wishes us to remember and to keep alive as a legacy from Frieda Fromm-Reichmann.

So, in conclusion, I deeply admire Gail for her persistence and scholarship, and for producing this evocative and clear text. Fromm-Reichmann has long deserved a biography, and is honored by this one. I think that in her writing of the biography, Gail sunk her fist into the tar-baby Frieda, and that she is struggling right along with the rest of us with complex

ambivalences toward Frieda and the standards Frieda's writings set for us. Losing Chestnut Lodge, for me, has forced me to confront my own ambivalences in a new way.

... I have said before  
That the past experience revived in the  
meaning  
Is not the experience of one life only

But of many generations—not forgetting  
Something that is probably quite ineffable:  
The backward look behind the assurance  
Of recorded history, the backward half-  
look

Over the shoulder, towards the primitive  
terror.

T.S. Eliot, *Four Quartets*, The Dry Salvages, 2

## REFERENCES

- ABLON, M. Tuesdays with Morrie: An Old Man, a Young Man, and Life's Greatest Lesson. Doubleday, 1997.
- BIRDWHISTELL, R. *Kinesics and Context: Essays on Body Motion Communication*. University of Pennsylvania Press, 1970.
- BOODMAN, S. A horrible place and a wonderful place. *The Washington Post Magazine* (October 8, 1989): pp. 18–24, 38–43.
- BULLARD, D., SR., ed. *Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy: Selected Writings of Frieda Fromm-Reichmann*. University of Chicago Press, 1959.
- BURNHAM, D. Discussion of Dr. Gail Hornstein's Frieda Fromm-Reichmann Memorial Lecture, 1996, unpublished.
- CAUDILL, W., and STAINBROOK, E. Some covert effects of communication difficulties in a psychiatric hospital. *Psychiatry* (1954) 17: 27–40.
- DAN, J. *Jewish Mysticism and Jewish Ethics*. University of Washington Press, 1986.
- DOLNICK, E. *Madness on the Couch: Blaming the Victim in the Heyday of Psychoanalysis*. Simon & Schuster, 1998.
- ELIOT, T. S. Four Quartets; The Dry Salvages. In A. Allison, H. Barrows, C. Blake, A. Carr, A. Eastman, and H. English, Jr., eds., *The Norton Anthology of Poetry, Revised* (pp. 1047–1051). Norton, 1975.
- FORT, J. Present-day treatment of schizophrenia. In A.-L. Silver, ed., *Psychoanalysis and Psychosis* (pp. 249–270). International Universities Press, 1989.
- FROMM-REICHMANN, F. *Principles of Intensive Psychotherapy*. University of Chicago Press, 1950.
- GAZETTE STAFF. Gazette wins 24 awards. *Rockville Gazette* (February 7, 2001).
- GOFFMAN, E. *Asylums: Essays on the Social Situation of Mental Patients and Other Inmates*. Doubleday, 1961.
- GREENBERG, J. (or Hannah Green). *I Never Promised You a Rose Garden*. Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1964.
- GREENBLATT, M., LEVINSON, D. J., and WILLIAMS, R. H. *The Patient and the Mental Hospital*. Free Press, 1952.
- HORNSTEIN, G. Frieda Fromm-Reichmann and the accidental biographer. *The Chronicle Review: The Chronicle of Higher Education*. (February 9, 2001): Section 2, B7–B9.
- HORNSTEIN, G. *To Redeem One Person Is to Redeem the World: The Life of Frieda Fromm-Reichmann*. Free Press, 2000.
- KIRSNER, D. *Unfree Associations: Inside Psychoanalytic Institutes*. Process Press, 2000.
- LANGS, R., and SEARLES, H. *Intrapsychic and Interpersonal Dimensions of Treatment: A Clinical Dialogue*. Aronson, 1980.
- LEHMAN, A., and STEINWACHS, D. At issue: Translating research into practice: The Schizophrenia Patient Outcomes Research Team (PORT) treatment recommendations. (National Institute of Mental Health). *Schizophrenia Bulletin* (1998) 24(1):1–10.
- LUHRMANN, T. God's work: Frieda Fromm-Reichmann and her fellow psychiatrists meant to do it. *The New York Times Book Review*. (January 7, 2001): 7.
- MCAFEE, L. Interview with Joanne Greenberg: With three poems by Joanne Greenberg. In A.-L. Silver, ed., *Psychoanalysis and Psychosis*. (pp. 513–533). International Universities Press, 1989.
- MCGORRY, P., YUNG, A., and PHILLIPS, L. "Closing in": What features predict the onset of first episode psychosis within an ultra high risk group? In R. Zipursky and S. Schulz, eds., *The Early Stages of Schizophrenia*. American Psychiatric Press, 2002.
- NOBLE, D., and BURNHAM, D. A history of the Washington Psychoanalytic Institute and Society. In A.-L. Silver, ed., *Psychoanalysis and Psychosis* (pp. 537–573). International Universities Press, 1989.
- PERRY, H. S. *Psychiatrist of America: The Life of Harry Stack Sullivan*. The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1982.
- QUINN, S. *A Mind of Her Own: The Life of Karen Horney*. Summit Books, 1987.

RIOCH, D., and STANTON, A. Milieu therapy. *Psychiatry* (1953) 16: 65-72.

ROAZEN, P. The exclusion of Erich Fromm from the IPA. *Contemporary Psychoanalysis* (2001) 37: 5-42.

SCHULZ, C., and KILGALEN, R. *Case Studies in Schizophrenia*. Basic Books, 1969.

SEARLES, H. Unconscious processes in relation to the environmental crisis. In H. F. Searles, *Countertransference and Related Subjects: Selected Papers* (pp. 228-242). International Universities Press, 1979.

SILVER, A.-L. The Chestnut Lodge Wednesday case conference: The one-to-one laboratory in its psychosocial setting. In G. Benedetti and P. Furlan, eds., *The Psychotherapy of Schizophrenia: Effective Clinical Approaches—Controversies, Critiques and Recommendations* (pp. 195-198). Hogrefe & Huber, 1993.

SILVER, A.-L. The current relevance of Fromm-Reichmann's works: The 2000 Frieda Fromm-Reichmann Lecture. *Psychiatry* (2000) 63: 308-22.

SILVER, A.-L. Introduction. In A.-L. Silver, ed., *Psychoanalysis and Psychosis* (pp. 1-12). International Universities Press, 1989.

SILVER, A.-L., and FEUER, P. C. Fromm-Reichmann's contributions at staff conferences. In A.-L. Silver, ed., *Psychoanalysis and Psychosis* (pp. 23-45). International Universities Press, 1989.

SMITH, N. A. Angels in the architecture: A contemporary case of orphic functioning. *Journal of the American Academy of Psychoanalysis* (2001) 29(4): 575-83.

STANTON, A. Some implications of the complexity of ego function and of self-representation for psychotherapy with psychotic patients. Chestnut Lodge Symposium in Memory of Dexter M. Bullard, Sr. (1982).

STANTON, A., and SCHWARTZ, M. *The Mental Hospital: A Study of Institutional Participation in Psychiatric Illness and Treatment*. Basic Books, 1954.

VOLKAN, V. *Linking Objects and Linking Phenomena: A Study of the Forms, Symptoms, Metapsychology, and Therapy of Complicated Mourning*. International Universities Press, 1981.

WEIGERT, E. *The Courage to Love*. Yale University Press, 1970.

WEIGERT, E. Introduction. In D. M. Bullard, ed., *Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy: Selected Writings of Frieda Fromm-Reichmann* (pp. v-x). University of Chicago Press, 1959.